

# Final Scoring Matrix

University of Utah  
 Business Loop Parking Structure- A/E  
 DFCM Project No. 13026750

March 28, 2013

Firms		A	B	C	D	E
Selection Criteria	Points Possible					
DFCM Past Performance Rating	10	9.4	9.4	8.9	9.0	9.6
Strength of Team	40	37.3	33.3	36.0	33.3	32.0
Project Management Approach	40	37.3	37.3	32.0	33.3	29.3
Schedule	10	9.0	9.7	8.7	8.0	8.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>93.0</b>	<b>89.7</b>	<b>85.6</b>	<b>83.7</b>	<b>78.9</b>

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the selection committee has selected VCBO Architecture as the firm that provides the best value for the State of Utah



Justification for Selection of VCBO for Design  
For the Business Loop Parking Structure

Date: March 29, 2013  
Manager: Rick James, Project Manager  
Project: Design for the Business Loop Parking Garage  
University of Utah  
**Re: Selection of VCBO for Programming Services**

**Recommendation:**

It is recommended to award the Design Services for the Business Loop Parking Structure to VCBO Architects.

**Justification:**

This selection is justified because of the following reasons:

- a) The average scores of the five firms were as follows.

Ranking	Average Score
1	93
2	89.7
3	85.6
4	83.7
5	78.9

- b) The selection was done with the Value Based Selection Method for AE Services. The process was conducted by the Project Manager according to the policy and rules for this procedure.
- c) The selection committee was appointed with three members as follows:
- a. DFCM Dave McKay, Program Director
  - b. U of U John McNary, Director of Planning, University of Utah
  - c. Invited: James Knight, Eaton Architecture
- d) The selection was based on the scoring each firm after the interviews. Cost was not a category of selection criteria.
- a. DFCM Past Performance Rating: The ratings were provided by DFCM and are the ratings currently on file for the five firms.
  - b. Strength of Team: Key points of this category were strengths in the area of Parking Structures experience. The selected team ranked highest in this category. Items discussed included the depth of experience in parking structures across the whole team, depth of experience in terms of design for protection against corrosion and design for smooth flow of traffic in and out of the structure for daily parking demands and for periodic athletic events. Discussions also included strength of teams in structural analysis and structural design of parking structures.
  - c. Project Management Approach: The highest ranked firms emphasized the importance of early involvement of all stakeholders and neighbors to the

new Business Loop Parking Structure. Highest ranked firms emphasized strategies to concentrate information gathering

- d. Schedule: The selected team clearly emphasized important milestones in the schedule. The highest ranked firms team indicated the earliest design completion.
- e) Interviews for Thatcher were held Thursday March 28, 2013 in the State Office Building, Room 4112. The interviews consisted of 30 Minutes for presentations, 10 Minutes for Q&A.