

# Final Scoring Matrix

Utah National Guard  
 South Garrison Infrastructure Ph. II Camp Williams  
 DFCM Project No. 13240480

July 30, 2014

Firms		A	B	C	D
Selection Criteria	Points Possible				
Cost	20	20.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Schedule	20	20.0	18.7	16.7	16.7
DFCM Past Performance Rating	10	8.2	8.3	8.2	9.0
Strength of Contractor's Team	20	18.0	16.7	18.0	16.0
Project Management Approach	25	24.2	20.8	20.0	20.0
Relevant Experience	5	5.0	4.2	4.8	4.7
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>95.4</b>	<b>68.7</b>	<b>67.7</b>	<b>66.3</b>

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the selection committee has selected Miller Paving, as the firm that provides the best value to the State of Utah.



State of Utah

GARY R. HERBERT  
Governor

SPENCER J COX  
Lieutenant Governor

Department of Administrative Services

KIMBERLY K. HOOD  
Executive Director

Division of Facilities Construction and Management

P. JOSHUA HAINES  
Director

Approved By: 

Date Approved: 8.1.14

**1 August 2014**

Agency: Utah National Guard

Project Name: South Garrison Infrastructure Phase II Camp Williams

DFCM Project No.: 13240480

DFCM Project Manager: Wayne Smith

**SELECTION COMMITTEE JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT**

The selection committee would like to express its appreciation to all of the teams that proposed for services on the above references project. The selection committee selected **Miller Paving** based on the following detailed conclusion supporting the selection in accordance with the selection criteria:

**Cost:**

**Miller Paving had the lowest cost including all alternate pricing and unit pricing. Miller Paving received full points for their cost proposal on this project.**

**DFCM Past Performance Rating:**

**This score is based on the average of ratings for previous projects as explained in the RFP.**

**Schedule:**

**Miller Paving had a very aggressive schedule which would allow for completion of the project by June 30, 2015. Their proposed schedule is significantly shorter than the other firms**

**Strength of Contractors Team:**

**Miller paving has exceptional work personnel. They are the current contractor for phase I and will be using the same project team for phase II. Miller Paving has demonstrated during phase I outstanding performance and their project management and site management personnel have far exceeded the expectations of the state and the National Guard**

**Project Management Approach:**

**Miller Paving has a very aggressive schedule and management plan for this project which will allow completion by June 30, 2015. They plan on working through the winter and keeping traffic flow open during the construction months. The Miller management team has taken all precautions to mitigate risk and proactively execute this project.**

**Relevant Experience:**

**Miller Paving has extensive experience working with the National Guard and the State of Utah.**

**They have been performing exceptionally well during phase I of this project with a great on-site superintendent who will be also involved in phase II**