

# Value-Based Selection Short List Scoring Matrix

West Valley Liquor Store - A/E Services  
 Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control  
 DFCM Project No. 15086030

Monday, November 23, 2015

Firms		A	B	C	D
Selection Criteria	Points Possible				
DFCM Past Performance Rating	50	44.7	44	43.33	46.6
Strength of Team					
Project Team Experience	10	9.7	8.7	8.3	7.3
Past Project Experience as a Team	10	9.7	9.3	8.7	9.0
Project Manager Experience	20	19.3	18.7	18.0	17.3
Design Architect Experience	20	19.3	18.7	18.0	18.7
Project Management Approach					
Programming Services	15	14.0	14.0	13.8	10.2
Budget Control Plan	5	4.7	4.7	4.7	2.3
Sub-consultant Management Plan	10	9.3	9.3	9.3	8.7
Risk Identification and Mitigation Plan	20	18.7	17.7	15.0	12.3
Schedule	10	9.0	8.7	8.7	9.3
Value Added Ideas	15	14.0	11.0	11.3	10.3
Creativity	15	14.0	11.7	12.7	10.7
Change Control Plan	5	4.0	4.7	4.7	2.3
BIM	5	3.7	4.3	4.7	2.0
<b>Total</b>	<b>210</b>	<b>194.0</b>	<b>185.3</b>	<b>181.2</b>	<b>167.1</b>

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the following firms have been short listed:

**Achiplex Group**  
**Dave Robinson Architecture**  
**Frank N. Murdock, Jr., Architect & Associates**  
**Naylor Wentworth Lund Architects**