

# Value-Based Selection Shortlist Scoring Matrix

Westpointe Career and Technical Education Center CMGC  
 Salt Lake Community College  
 DFCM Project No. 15106660

Thursday, August 13, 2015

| Firms  |                 | A                           | B            | C            | D            | E            | F            |
|--|-----------------|-----------------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| Selection Criteria                           | Points Possible |                             |              |              |              |              |              |
| DFCM Past Performance Rating                 | 50              | 47.8                        | 49           | 48.2         | 47.7         | 44.8         | 48.5         |
|  |                 | Strength of Team            |              |              |              |              |              |
| Project Specific Team Experience             | 25              | 24.0                        | 21.0         | 20.0         | 24.0         | 19.0         | 18.0         |
| Team Member Availability                     | 10              | 9.0                         | 7.7          | 6.7          | 4.7          | 7.3          | 5.3          |
| Project Manager Experience                   | 10              | 8.3                         | 8.0          | 7.0          | 8.7          | 7.0          | 6.3          |
| Superintendent Experience                    | 15              | 13.3                        | 13.0         | 12.0         | 13.0         | 11.3         | 10.0         |
| Project Engineer Experience                  | 10              | 8.7                         | 6.7          | 5.7          | 8.3          | 7.3          | 5.7          |
| Project Estimator Experience                 | 10              | 9.0                         | 8.0          | 7.7          | 8.3          | 7.0          | 6.7          |
|  |                 | Project Management Approach |              |              |              |              |              |
| Estimating Experience                        | 15              | 14.0                        | 12.7         | 12.3         | 13.3         | 11.3         | 9.7          |
| Cost Control Plan                            | 10              | 9.3                         | 8.0          | 7.3          | 7.7          | 6.7          | 6.0          |
| Project Collaboration and Communication Plan | 25              | 22.7                        | 20.3         | 19.0         | 20.3         | 18.7         | 17.7         |
| Risk Identification and Mitigation Plan      | 10              | 8.7                         | 8.0          | 7.0          | 7.0          | 6.7          | 6.3          |
| Value Added Ideas                            | 50              | 44.7                        | 36.0         | 36.0         | 23.0         | 39.7         | 31.0         |
| BIM Use and Experience                       | 10              | 9.3                         | 9.0          | 7.7          | 8.0          | 4.7          | 6.3          |
| <b>Total</b>                                 | <b>250</b>      | <b>228.8</b>                | <b>207.3</b> | <b>196.5</b> | <b>194.0</b> | <b>191.5</b> | <b>177.5</b> |

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the selection committee has short listed the following firms:

**Big-D Construction**  
**Jacobsen Construction**  
**Layton Construction**