

# Value-Based Selection Short List Scoring Matrix

Clinical Services Building - CM/GC Services  
 Utah State University  
 DFCM Project No. 15128770

Tuesday, September 1, 2015

| Firms   |                 | A            | B            | C            | D            | E            | F            |
|---|-----------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| Selection Criteria                                    | Points Possible |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| DFCM Past Performance Rating                          | 50              | 47.5         | 44.1         | 49           | 47.7         | 41.9         | 44.8         |
| Strength of Team                                      |                 |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Project Team Experience                               | 30              | 26.7         | 25.7         | 23.0         | 20.0         | 18.3         | 19.0         |
| Team Member Availability                              | 15              | 14.0         | 14.3         | 12.7         | 12.3         | 10.7         | 12.0         |
| Superintendent Experience                             | 20              | 17.7         | 18.3         | 16.3         | 15.3         | 14.0         | 14.3         |
| Project Estimator Experience                          | 30              | 28.0         | 25.0         | 26.0         | 24.7         | 22.0         | 21.3         |
| Experience of Additional Project Specific Team Member | 15              | 13.7         | 13.3         | 12.3         | 12.0         | 11.0         | 11.0         |
| Project Engineer Experience                           | 20              | 17.3         | 15.7         | 15.3         | 14.3         | 12.7         | 11.7         |
| Project Team Interaction                              | 25              | 22.3         | 23.7         | 21.0         | 21.7         | 17.3         | 16.7         |
| Project Management Approach                           |                 |              |              |              |              |              |              |
| Estimating Experience                                 | 30              | 28.0         | 25.3         | 25.7         | 24.7         | 22.0         | 19.7         |
| Scope Control Plan                                    | 15              | 14.3         | 14.3         | 13.0         | 12.7         | 10.7         | 11.7         |
| Project Communication Plan                            | 10              | 9.0          | 9.0          | 7.7          | 7.3          | 6.3          | 6.7          |
| Risk Identification and Mitigation Plan               | 25              | 23.3         | 22.7         | 23.7         | 18.7         | 17.7         | 17.7         |
| Safety Plan   | 30              | 28.7         | 27.3         | 29.0         | 28.7         | 23.3         | 24.7         |
| Value Added Ideas                                     | 30              | 26.0         | 27.0         | 22.3         | 19.3         | 27.0         | 19.3         |
| BIM Use and Experience                                | 10              | 9.0          | 9.0          | 9.7          | 9.3          | 5.7          | 7.3          |
| Change Control Plan                                   | 15              | 14.0         | 14.0         | 12.0         | 12.0         | 8.3          | 9.3          |
| <b>Total</b>  | <b>370</b>      | <b>339.5</b> | <b>328.8</b> | <b>318.7</b> | <b>300.7</b> | <b>268.9</b> | <b>267.1</b> |

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the following firms have been short listed:

**Jacobsen Construction**  
**Layton Construction**  
**R&O Construction**