

# Value-Based Selection Final Selection Scoring Matrix

Salt Lake West Maintenance Station - A/E Services  
 Utah Department of Transportation  
 DFCM Project No. 16027900

Wednesday, June 1, 2016

Firms		A	B	C	D	E	F	G
Selection Criteria	Points Possible							
DFCM Past Performance Rating	50	47.8	45.7	47.5	46.3	42.5	47.5	43.3
Strength of Team								
Project Team Experience	10	8.7	9.0	9.0	8.0	9.0	8.3	8.0
Past Project Experience as a Team	10	8.3	8.7	8.0	8.3	9.0	8.3	7.7
Design Architect Experience	20	18.0	19.0	18.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	16.7
Project Architects Experience	10	8.7	9.0	8.7	8.7	8.7	8.3	7.7
Project Management Approach								
Budget Control Plan	10	9.3	8.7	8.3	7.3	8.3	9.3	6.0
Project Communication Plan	10	9.3	7.7	8.0	7.7	8.7	8.0	6.7
Sub-Consultant Management Plan	20	16.0	16.0	16.3	16.3	16.3	14.7	10.0
Risk Identification and Mitigation Plan	10	9.0	9.3	9.0	8.7	9.3	9.0	9.7
Value Added Ideas	20	15.3	15.0	15.0	16.0	15.3	14.3	13.0
Creativity	10	7.3	7.7	7.3	9.0	7.3	6.7	7.3
<b>Total</b>	<b>180</b>	<b>157.8</b>	<b>155.7</b>	<b>155.2</b>	<b>153.3</b>	<b>152.5</b>	<b>151.5</b>	<b>136.0</b>

Following the evaluation of each of the firms that submitted on this project, the selection committee has ranked JRCA Architects, Inc., as the firm that provides the best value to the State of Utah.



State of Utah

GARY R. HERBERT  
Governor

SPENCER J COX  
Lieutenant Governor

Department of Administrative Services

KIMBERLY K. HOOD  
Executive Director

Division of Facilities Construction and Management

ERIC R. THOLEN  
Director

Approved By: 

Date Approved: 06.01.2016

1 June 2016

Agency: **Utah Department of Transportation**

Project Name: **Salt Lake West Maintenance Station – A/E Services**

DFCM Project No.: **16027900**

DFCM Project Manager: **Matthias Mueller**

**SELECTION COMMITTEE JUSTIFICATION STATEMENT**

The selection committee would like to express its appreciation to all of the teams that proposed for services on the above references project. The selection committee selected **JRCA Architects, Inc.**, based on the following detailed scoring matrix and in accordance with the selection criteria:

See the attached scoring matrix for the evaluation details.